# Advanced data analysis II 

9. Exercise

Prof. Tobias Scheffer Dr. Niels Landwehr Ahmed Abdelwahab

Winter 2015
From: 15.12.15
To: 05.01.16

Exercise 1
Message Passing Algorithm

Consider the following Bayesian network over the six binary random variables $x_{1}, x_{2}, x_{3}$, $x_{4}, x_{5}, x_{6}$.


| $p\left(x_{2}=1 \mid x_{1}\right)$ | $x_{1}$ |
| :---: | :---: |
| 0.6 | 0 |
| 0.3 | 1 |


| $p\left(x_{3}=1 \mid x_{2}\right)$ | $x_{2}$ |
| :---: | :---: |
| 0.7 | 0 |
| 0.4 | 1 |


| $p\left(x_{4}=1 \mid x_{3}\right)$ | $x_{3}$ |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 0.2 | 0 |  |
| 0.5 | 1 |  |
|  |  |  |
| $p\left(x_{5}=1 \mid x_{1}, x_{4}\right)$ $x_{1}$ $x_{4}$ <br> 0.3 0 0 <br> 0.6 1 0 <br> 0.5 0 1 <br> 0.1 1 1 <br> $p\left(x_{6}=1 \mid x_{1}, x_{5}\right)$ $x_{1}$ $x_{5}$ <br> 0.5 0 0 <br> 0.1 1 0 <br> 0.3 0 1 <br> 0.4 1 1  . |  |  | | ( |
| :---: |

We want to calculate the conditional distribution $p\left(x_{3} \mid x_{1}=0, x_{4}=1\right)$ using the Message Passing algorithm.

1. First show that the inference query $p\left(x_{3} \mid x_{1}=0, x_{4}=1\right)$ in the original graphical model yields the same result as the inference query $p\left(x_{3} \mid x_{1}=0, x_{4}=1\right)$ in the following simpler graphical model:


Here, we assume the same (conditional) distributions for the variables $x_{1}, x_{2}, x_{3}, x_{4}$.
2. Calculate $p\left(x_{3} \mid x_{1}=0, x_{4}=1\right)$ by Message Passing on the linear chain.

We study the following domain: a fair coin is tossed twice; the results of tosses are represented by the random variables $X, Y \in\{0,1\}$. We define a third random variable $Z$ by $Z=\operatorname{xor}(X, Y)$, that is, $Z$ is one if exactly one of the two variables $X, Y$ has the value one.

1. What is the joint distribution $p(X, Y, Z)$ over the three random variables $X, Y, Z$ ?
2. (a) Are $X, Y, Z$ pairwise independent? That is, does it hold that $p(X, Y)=$ $p(X) p(Y), p(X, Z)=p(X) p(Z)$, and $p(Y, Z)=p(Y) p(Z)$ ?
(b) Are $X, Y, Z$ independent? That is, does it hold that $p(X, Y, Z)=$ $p(X) p(Y) p(Z) ?$
(c) Specify all independencies that hold in the distribution $p(X, Y, Z)$, in the form of a set

$$
I(p):=\{(A \perp B \mid C) \mid p(A \mid B, C)=p(A \mid C)\}
$$

where $A, B, C$ are any subsets of $\{X, Y, Z\}$.
3. Construct a Bayesian network for the distribution $p(X, Y, Z)$. Does it hold that $I(G)=I(p)$ ?

We study the following simple graphical model over the three binary variables $T$ (tank filled), $B$ (battery voltage ok) and $M$ (motor starts):


| $p(M=1 \mid B, T)$ | $B$ | $T$ |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| $\theta_{M \mid 00}$ | 0 | 0 |
| $\theta_{M \mid 01}$ | 0 | 1 |
| $\theta_{M \mid 10}$ | 1 | 0 |
| $\theta_{M \mid 11}$ | 1 | 1 |

The joint distribution $p(B, M, T)=p(B) p(T) p(M \mid B, T)$ is parameterized by the six parameters $\theta_{B}, \theta_{T}, \theta_{M \mid 00}, \ldots, \theta_{M \mid 11}$ given in the tables. Unfortunately, we do not know the true parameter values. However, we have made the following 10 observations of the system:

| $B$ | $T$ | $M$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | 1 | 1 |
| 1 | 1 | 1 |
| 1 | 0 | 0 |
| 1 | 0 | 0 |
| 1 | 0 | 0 |
| 1 | 0 | 1 |
| 0 | 1 | 0 |
| 0 | 1 | 0 |
| 0 | 1 | 1 |
| 0 | 0 | 0 |

1. We would like to estimate the true parameter values from the observations. In order to do that, derive the likelihood of the observations as a function of the six parameters. We assume as usual that individual observations are independent given the model. Compute estimates $\hat{\theta}_{B}, \hat{\theta}_{T}, \hat{\theta}_{M \mid 00}, \ldots, \hat{\theta}_{M \mid 11}$ of the true parameters that maximize the likelihood (hint: logarithm, derivative).
2. Maximum likelihood parameter estimates often lead to unrealistic estimates of zero or one for probabilities.
Argue which prior distribution would be suitable to prevent these cases. What is the corresponding posterior distribution over parameters, and how can we calculate the corresponding maximum a posteriori parameters?
